

# Tier 2 Evaluation Results

## Proposed Options Not Carried Forward

### Franklin Road

Franklin Road provides similar benefits and impacts to Fairview Avenue/Cherry Lane, but there are additional factors for why the corridor is not proposed to advance to Tier 3.

- » Franklin is a critical urban freight corridor and high-capacity transit may disrupt freight operations.
- » Fewer people are forecasted to live along the route option.
- » Passes through fewer communities with higher likelihood of using transit.

Following initial outreach to study stakeholders, there was interest in combining the most promising segments of the Fairview Avenue/Cherry Lane and Franklin Road routes to connect to more key regional and community destinations.

### Fairview Avenue/Cherry Lane

#### BRT BAT

The Fairview Avenue/Cherry Lane BRT-BAT mode option is not proposed to advance to Tier 3. While the route provide similar benefits to the exclusive BRT option, BRT BAT would result in:

- » Greater number of property acquisitions
- » Significant changes to the right-of-way to accommodate the service
- » Significant impacts to a large number of historic properties

#### LIGHT RAIL (LRT)

LRT was not carried forward following the mode evaluation. Ultimately, when compared to other modes, LRT scored lower due to several factors:

- » More expensive to construct.
- » Requires more space to safely operate in the freight rail corridor.
- » More effective in urban environments with frequent stops.
- » Incompatible with typical freight corridor design and purpose.

#### BRT MIXED TRAFFIC

BRT Mixed Traffic was not carried forward following the mode evaluation. When compared to other modes, BRT Mixed Traffic scored lower due to several key issues:

- » Buses would face congestion and delays similar to other vehicles. Delays are compounded over the 30-mile corridor.
- » BRT improvements are expensive. Potential poor return on investment if buses are delayed in traffic.
- » BRT is expected to be faster and more predictable than local service. Mixed traffic BRT would not meet rider expectations.

## Proposed Options Carried Forward to Tier 3

### Boise Cut-Off

#### COMMUTER RAIL

- » Provides reliable and exclusive service to regional activity centers including Downtown Caldwell, Nampa, and Meridian, while requiring shuttle service to Boise's center.
- » Most of the infrastructure could be constructed within the existing right-of-way.
- » Fewer environmental impacts compared to other options.

### I-84/I-184

#### BRT/BAT

- » Provides similar reliability and exclusivity as Commuter Rail at a reduced cost.
- » Most of the infrastructure could be constructed within the existing right-of-way.
- » Fewer environmental impacts compared to other options.
- » Minimal traffic impacts.

### Fairview Avenue/Cherry Lane

#### BRT EXCLUSIVE

- » Provides more connections to key destinations, community resources, jobs, existing and future transit, and pedestrian and bicycle facilities compared to Franklin Rd.
- » Passes through more communities with higher likelihood of using the service.
- » Provides services to more people (current and future).
- » While the Franklin Rd route is not proposed to advance into Tier 3, initial outreach to stakeholders showed interest in combining Fairview Ave/Cherry Lane and Franklin Rd routes to capture activity centers along Franklin.