Valuing Parking and The Land on which it Stands

Norman W. Garrick
Does A-Town Have Enough Parking?
How About B-Town?
A-Town versus B-Town
How do they stack-up against each other?
Environment? Social? Economy?
When is enough, *enough*?

What is the *cost* of too much?

*A-town or B-town: accident or policy?*
Parking in Hartford
1950s versus 2000s

1959

2009

On Streets | Surface Lots | Garages
---|---|---
16320 | 47050 |
Hartford 1957
16,000 Parking Spaces
Population 180 K
Jobs no change
4 Major Department Stores

Hartford 2009
47,000 Parking Spaces
Population 120 K
Jobs no change
0 Department Stores
Hartford and Cambridge
1950s versus 2000s
Growth in Parking
1960 to 2000

- Cambridge, MA
- Berkeley, CA
- Arlington, VA

- Hartford, CT
- New Haven, CT
- Lowell, MA
Parking Spaces for Each Commuter
Residents Commuting by Auto

1960 1980 2000

40% 50% 60% 70%
Per Capita Income

- 1960: 20,000
- 1980: 40,000
- 2000: 60,000

Income levels from 1960 to 2000.
The “Science” of Traffic Planning

In the diagram, the increase in the registration of motor vehicles in Rochester, New York, is illustrated from 1922 to 1928. The summary of registration shows the following numbers:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Registration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1922</td>
<td>45,694</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1923</td>
<td>56,474</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1924</td>
<td>64,976</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1925</td>
<td>72,575</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1926</td>
<td>81,414</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1927</td>
<td>86,471</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1928</td>
<td>90,914</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The “Science” of Traffic Planning

**Major Streets**

Four Line Streets

Four line thoroughfares with transit lines inadequate for major street purposes. There should be roadway space for at least one free moving line of vehicles in each direction.

Normal width 80', minimum width 60'.

All new major streets should have a minimum width of 80 feet. The street should be developed so that it can ultimately be widened to a 6 line thoroughfare and public utilities should be installed in accordance with final development.

**Six Line Streets**

Showing proper treatment through a residence district.

**Eight Line Streets**

First stage - through residence district.

Second stage - traffic volume heavier bus or car lines using street.

Final stage - through residence district single roadway types.

First stage - residence or commercial districts.

Second stage - showing adaptation to street car operation.

Final stage - full business use double roadway types.
“Science” of Traffic Planning = Induce Driving
Parking
But Which is Cause?
And Which is Effect?

Do we build more parking because driving is increasing?
Or does more parking lead to more driving?
According to repeated nationwide surveys,

More Doctors Smoke CAMELS than any other cigarette!

Doctors in every branch of medicine were asked, "What cigarette do you smoke?"
The brand named most was Camel!

You'll enjoy Camels for the same reasons so many doctors enjoy them. Camels have cool, cool mildness, pack after pack, and a flavor unmatched by any other cigarette.

Make this sensible test: Smoke only Camels for 30 days and see how well Camels please your taste, how well they suit your throat as your steady smoke. You'll see how enjoyable a cigarette can be!

THE DOCTORS' CHOICE IS AMERICA'S CHOICE!

MURIEL D'ARRIO says: "I pick Camels. They agree with my throat and taste wonderful!"

DICK HAYMES says: "I get more pleasure from Camels than from any other brand!"

RALPH BELLAMY reports: "Camels suit my taste and throat. I've smoked 'em for years!"

For 30 days, test Camels in your "T-Zone" (T for Throat, T for Taste).
Sir Austin Bradford Hill (with Richard Doll) demonstrated the connection between **smoking and lung cancer**

The so-called **Bradford Hill Criteria** were formulated as a way to demonstrate a causal association
Bradford Hill’s Criteria
For Assessing Causality

1. Strength of Association
2. Consistency
3. Specificity
4. Temporality
5. Dose Response (biological gradient)
6. Plausibility and Coherence
7. Experiment
8. Analogy

Our study found that the majority of these criteria fit when applied to parking in cities
More parking induces more driving
Hartford's property tax structure makes little sense.

By assessing vacant lots and surface parking lots at a much lower rate than commercial buildings, the city has encouraged the proliferation of what urban designers call "parking craters"

Hartford Courant Editorial
ELVIS PRESLEY

Jailhouse Rock

C/W TREAT ME NICE

(from the Aven production, an M-G-M release, "Jailhouse Rock")

RCA Victor

47-7035
SOME ENCHANTED EVENING
(from the musical production "South Pacific")
(Oscar Hammerstein II - Richard Rodgers)

Perry Como
with Orchestra conducted by
Mitchell Ayres
Scary Lucy in Buffalo
The Crisis in the Cities

*in the 50s and On*

City Population

Motor Vehicles per 1000

440,000 1962

370,000 1980
Zürich, Switzerland in the 1950s
MARK GOLDMAN

CITY ON THE EDGE

BUFFALO, NEW YORK
“The city projected a need for 14,000 new spaces.

According to Mayor Joseph Mruk, not only would the city build 3 parking garages but would encourage private development of parking lots by condemnation and assembly of necessary sites.”

From Mark Goldman’s City on the Edge
“The campaign to build parking spaces for 25,000 cars began in 1950 and 50 years later is still ongoing”

From Mark Goldman’s City on the Edge
“The people of Buffalo watched as the fabric of their City came tumbling down. Falling with it was their history and their heritage and, unbeknownst to them, their future as well.”

From Mark Goldman’s City on the Edge
Bridgeport 1913
Hartford Eliminates Parking Minimums Citywide

By Angie Schmitt | Dec 13, 2017 | 29 COMMENTS
Hartford Set to Pass New *Parking* Ordinance

Ordinance will impose new fee on Parking equivalent to 25 cents per space/day. This fee will go to 50 cents in 2025 and $1 in 2030.

At current rate fee will raise about $2 million annually.
Policies for Valuing Parking
Traditional Sites:
- West Hartford, CT
- Northampton, MA
- Brattleboro, VT

Contemporary Sites:
- Avon, CT
- Glastonbury, CT
- Somerset Square in Glastonbury, CT
Parking Spaces per 1000 sq. feet of Building Space

- **Traditional Site**
  - Average Occupancy: 1.5
  - Peak Occupancy: 2.5
  - Parking Available: 2
  - Parking Required by Zoning: 3

- **Contemporary Site**
  - Average Occupancy: 2.5
  - Peak Occupancy: 3.5
  - Parking Available: 4
  - Parking Required by Zoning: 5
Cars versus People

Tradational Site

Contemporary Site
Lessons from Parking
In Small New England Cities

Traditional Sites:
What Did They Do Well?
Managed Parking
Shared Parking
Park Once, then Walk
Charge for Parking

Yet they still require way too much parking
No Kidding! Really Powerful
Six Essential Rules for Effective Parking Management

1. Base decisions on actual data
2. Eliminate minimum parking requirements
3. Optimize the use of available parking
4. Recognize that free parking is not a thing
5. Eliminate/reduce subsidies for driving
6. Subsidize more sustainable forms of travel